# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS vii
COPYRIGHT PERMISSIONS viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS xi
TABLE OF CASES xix
DEVELOPMENT OF LABOR ARBITRATION 1
A. Brief Historical Review of Labor Arbitration 1
B. Legal Status of Labor Arbitration: The Creation of Federal Common Law 1
U.S. Supreme Court Decisions 1
1. Textile Workers' Union v. Lincoln Mills, 353 U.S. 448 (1957) 2
2. United Steelworkers v. Warrior & Gulf Navigation Company, 363 U.S. 574 (1960) 6
3. United Steelworkers v. American Manufacturing Company, 363 U.S. 564 (1960) 13
4. United Steelworkers v. Enterprise Wheel & Car Corporation, 363 U.S. 593 (1960) 16
C. Arbitrability Issues 20
Procedural Arbitrability 20
1. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. v. Livingston, 376 U.S. 543 (1964) <b>20</b>
<ol> <li>Nolde Brothers, Inc. v. Local No. 348, Bakery &amp; Confectionary Workers Union, AFL-CIO, 430</li> <li>U.S. 243 (1977)</li> </ol>
3. The Green Bakery Company, Inc., Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2010) 31
4. County of Allegheny and Allegheny Court Association of Professional Employees, Acape Unit 1603, 134 BNA LA 977 (Kobell, 2015) 38
5. Department of Veterans Affair v. VA Medical Center, 2010 LA Supp. 119534 ( F. Weatherspoon, 2010) 46
6. Ohio Education Association, State Council Of Professional Educators, 1995 LA Supp. 119206 (F.
Weatherspoon, 1995) 49
Substantive Arbitrability 56
<ol> <li>AT&amp;T Technologies, Inc. v. Communications Workers of American, et al., 475 U.S. 643</li> <li>57</li> </ol>
2. Communications Workers v. New York Telephone Co., 327 F.2d 94 (2d Cir. 1964) 62
3. Litton Financial Printing Division v. National Labor Relations Board, 111 S. Ct., 2215 (1991) 65
4. Medco Health Solutions of Columbus West, Ltd. v. Association of Managed Care Pharmacists,

2011 WL 4572002 (S.D. Ohio 2011) 72

ı.

 Roger Williams Univ. Faculty Ass'n v. Roger Williams University, 14 F. Supp. 3d 27 C.A. No. 13-16L (2014 U.S. Dist.)

#### II. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS 81

# A. Public Policy Issues 81

- 1. W.R. Grace & Co. v. Rubber Workers, 461 U.S. 757 (1983) 81
- 2. United Paperworkers International Union, AFL-CIO v. Misco, Inc., 484 U.S. 29 (1987) 84
- City of Sidney, Ohio v. Fraternal Order of Police, Common Pleas Court of Shelby County, Ohio, Case No. 10VC000497 (2011)
   91
- 4. Medco Health Solutions of Columbus West v. The Association of Managed Care Pharmacists, 2009 U S> Dist. LEXIS 106256 (2009)  $\phantom{0}96$
- 5. City of Des Plaines v. Metro. Alliance of Police, Chapter No. 240, 2015 IL App  $(1^{st})$  140957; 2015 Ill.App.LEXIS 223 102

Summary of Cases on Judicial Review 110

#### Sexual Harassment Issues 113

Bethel Park School Dist. v. Bethel Park Federation of Teachers, Local 1607, 55 A.3d 154, 193
 L.R.R.M. (BNA) (2012) 113

Summary of Cases on Sexual Harassment and Public Policy 118

# B. Challenges Based On Claims That The Arbitrator Exceeded Their Powers 120

- Oakwood Healthcare, Inc. V. Oakwood Hospital Employees, Local 2568 2014 U. S. Dist. LEXIS 107089 (2014) 120
- Schlage Lock Company LLC V. United Steelworkers AFL-CIO, Local No. 7697, 202 LRRM 3058
   (S.D. Ohio, 2014) 127
- 3. Mass. Bd. of Higher Education v. Mass. Teachers Ass'n, 79 Mass. App. Ct. 27, (2011)
   132 Summary of Rules on Arbitrator's Authority
   139
   Summary of Rules on Misconduct of Arbitrators
   141

# C. Allegation Arbitrator Was Guilty Of Misconduct or Partiality 142

- 1. Delaware Transit Corp. v. Amalgamated Transit Union Local 42 34 A.3d 1064 (2011) 142
- 2. McVay V. Halliburton Energy Services, INC., 688 F.Supp.2d 556 (2010) 149

Summary of Court Cases Involving Misconduct of Arbitrators 155

Summary of Rules on Misconduct of Arbitrators 155

#### III. THE ARBITRATION PROCESS 157

# A. The Grievance Process 157

Julius G. Getman, Labor Arbitration and Dispute Resolution, 88 YALE L. J. 916 (April, 1979) 157

#### B. Selection of the Arbitrator 160

#### D. Diversity In Arbitration 162

Floyd D. Weatherspoon, Eliminating Barriers for Minority ADR Neutrals, 35 ACRESOLUTION (Spring 2006) 162

Floyd D. Weatherspoon, The Impact Of The Growth And Use Of ADR Processes On Minority Communities, Individual Rights, And Neutrals, 39 CAP.U.L.REV. 789 (2011) 166

#### E. NLRB Deferral of Arbitration 169

- Collyer Insulated Wire, A Gulf And Western Systems Co. And Local Union 1098, International Brotherhood Of Electrical Workers, AFL CIO 192, N.L.R.B. 837 (J. Fitzpatrick, 1971) 170
- Babcock & Wilcox Construction Co., Inc. and Coletta Kim Beneli 2014 NLRB LEXIS 964; 201
   L.R.R.M. 2057; 2014-15 NLRB Dec. (CCH) P15 ,892; 361 NLRB No. 132 (2014) 174
- Babcock & Wilcox Construction Co., Inc. and Coletta Kim Beneli, NLRB Office of The General Counsel Memorandum Gc 15-02 (2015)
   181

# IV. DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS, SUSPENSIONS, DEMOTIONS, AND TERMINATION DISPUTES 185

# A. Development of the Traditional Just Cause Analysis 185

- 1. Grief Bros. Cooperage Corp., 42 LA 555(Daugherty, 1964) 186
- 2. Enterprise Wire Co., 46 LA 359(Daugherty, 1966) 192

# B. The Elements of Just Cause 195

# Advance Warning of Possible Disciplinary to Employee 195

- Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority v. Amalgamated Transit Union Local 268,134 BNA LA 859 (Skulina, 2015) 195
- San Diego Trolley, Inc. And International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 465, 112 BNA
   LA 323 (Prayzich, 1999) 197
- Donaldson Mining Company And United Mine Workers of America, District 17 Local 340, 91
   BNA LA 471 (M. Zobrak, 1988) 201
- National Football League Management Council v. National Football League Players Association,
   2015 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 117662 (2015) 206

#### The Violated Policy/Rule Is Reasonable 215

- Atmos Energy Corp. and Int'l Chem. Workers Union And Commercial Workers Union Local 1047c, 121 BNA LA 908 (Howell, 2005)
- Quaker State Corp. and Oil, Chemical and Atomic Workers Int'l Union, Local 8-481, 92 BNA LA 898 (R. Talarico, 1989)
   223
- Pan American Airways Corp. and Air Line Pilots Association 116 BNA La 757 (Nolan, 2001) 230

# An Investigation Was Completed Before Discipline Issued 237

1. Trinity East And Ohio Council 8, Afscme Local 2934, 131 LA 1242 (Fullmer, 2013) 237

- 2. Crane Plumbing, 107 BNA LA 1084 (J. Fullmer, 1996) 244
- 3. State of Florida Department Of Corrections, 134 BNA LA 1181 (Abrams, 2015) 251

#### The Investigation Was Fair 256

- City Of Mason And Mason Professional Firefighters, IAFf Local 4039 134 BNA LA 1165 (Tolley, 2015) 256
- Nuplex Resins, Llc Louisville, Kentucky And International Chemical Workers Union, Local 15c, 133 BNA LA 996 (Wilson, 2014) 263
- 3. 2007 AAA Lexis 1475, American Arbitratin Association 268

#### Substantial Evidence is Present A Violation Occurred 275

- 1. The City Of Green, Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2005) 275
- 2. Pepsi-Cola General Bottlers, 010214/06274-A, 117 BNA LA 681 (Goldstein, 2002) 282

#### There was no Discrimination or Disparate Treatment 290

- 1. The Green Ballpark, Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2007) 290
- 2. 2006 AAA LEXIS 356, American Arbitration Association 296
- 3. Teva Pharmaceuticals and Teamsters, Local 688, 134 BNA LA 715 (Fowler, 2014) 299

#### The Degree of Discipline was Reasonable 305

- 1. The Green Company, Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2015) 305
- 2. 2008 AAA LEXIS 876, American Arbitration Association, (F Weatherspoon, 2008) 312
- Reckitt Benckiser, Inc. and UFCW, District Union Local 2, 133 BNA LA 1550 (Fitzsimmons, 2014) 318
- National Football League and National Football League Players Association, 134 BNA LA 61
   (Jones, 2014) 325
- City of Brooklyn and Municipal Foremen and Laborers' Union, Local 1099 134 LA 1066 (J. Fullmer, 2015) 328
- Greater Cleveland Reg'l Transit Auth. and Amalgamated Transit Union Local 268, 135 BNA LA
   (F. Weatherspoon, 2015) 336

# C. Progressive Discipline and Last Chance Agreements 342

Kathleen Birkhofer, Last Chance Agreements: How Many Chances Is an Employee Entitled To, 2005

- J. Disp. Resol. 467 (2005) 343
- 1. UWUA, Local, and Employer, BNA LA Supp. 148043 (Maher, 2013) 35:
- U.S. Tsubaki Power Transmission LLC [Chicopee, Mass.] and Steelworkers, Local #7912, 132
   BNA LA 1116 (Abrams, 2013) 354
- Flexsys America L.P., a subsidiary of Eastman Chemical Plant Monogahela Plant and United Steelworkers, Local, 4693-94, 134 BNA LA 1357 (Wood, 2015)
   356

# D. Just Cause Analysis in the Federal Sector: The Douglas Factors 358

Curtis Douglas V. Veterans Administration, Et Al M.S.P.B. 313; 5 M.S.P.R. 280; 981 MSPB LEXIS
 886 (1981) 358

 Council of Prison Locals, AFL-CIO, American Federation of Government Employees, Local 607 and U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons, FCI Elkton, Ohio: Federal Arbitration 06-58294 (November 11, 2007) 364

# E. The Burden of Proof in Disciplinary Cases 374

- 1. Monterey Mushrooms and United Farm Workers 130 BNA LA 998 (Riker, 2012) 374
- 2. Square Plus Operating Corp. v. Local Union No. 917, 140 LRRM 2389 (S.D.N.Y. 1992) 381

#### V. ISSUE GRIEVANCES 385

# A. The Contract Interpretation Analysis 385

Jay E. Grenig, *Principles Of Contract Interpretation: Interpreting Collective Bargaining Agreements*, 16 Cap. U. L. Rev. 31 (1986) 385

 Colfax Envelope Corp. v. Local No. 458-3M, Chicago Graphic Communications Internat'l Union, AFL-CIO, 20 F.3d, 750 (7th Cir. 1994)
 391

# The Plain Meaning Rule 398

- 1. Air System Components, 125 BNA LA 100 (Dilts, 2008) 398
- 2. Washington State Ferries, 133 BNA LA 641 (Nickleberry, 2014) 406

# Ambiguous v. Unambiguous Contract Language 412

1. National Basketball Association And Players' Association, 52 BNA LA 702 (Turkus, 1969) 412

# Parol Evidence 417

1. CVS Pharmacy, 2012 BNA LA Supp. 147419 (E. Goldstein, 2012 417

#### B. Pattern Practices and Custom Cases 423

Richard Mittenthal, Past Practice and The Administration Of Collective Bargaining Agreements,
Proceedings of the 14th Annual Meeting of the National Academy of Arbitrators (1961) 429
The Problem of Past Practices of Shift Assignments 427

- WPLG-TV And I.A.T.S.E. Photographers Local 666 1993 BNA LA Supp. 102771 (R. Abrams, 1993) 428
- Alpena Gen. Hosp. and Local 204, United Stone, and Allied Products Workers, 50 BNA LA 48
   (Jones, 1967) 435

The Problem of Payment for Travel Time and Pattern and Practice 440

#### VI. VARIOUS TYPES OF SUBJECTS IN ARBITRATION 441

# A. Management Rights 441

- 1. 2014 AAA LEXIS 168, American Arbitration Association 441
- 2. Brentwood School District, 134 BNA LA 1173 (Felice, 2015) 446

The Problem of the Scope of a Management Rights Clause 451

# B. Seniority Rights 452

- Internat'l Brotherhood of Teamsters, Local 120 and
   University of St. Thomas, 2010 WL 805003 MN BMS (A. Beens)
- City of Wadsworth and The Ohio Patrolmen's ,Benevolent Association, 134 BNA LA 641 (Bell, 2015) 458
- Cargill Meat Solutions, 133 BNA LA 1528 (Bonney, 2014)
   The Problem of Seniority Rights v. Management Rights 470

# C. Hiring and Filling Vacancies 472

Ohio Association of Public School Employees OAPSE/AFSCME, AFL-CIO, 2013 LA Supp. 149983
 (F. Weatherspoon, 2013) 472

The Problem of Hiring and Filling Vacancies 478

#### D. Subcontracting 480

- Anheuser-Busch, Inc. and International Brotherhood of Teamsters, Local, 132 BNA LA 945 (Fitzsimmons, 2013) 480
- University of The Pacific Physical Plant and Genera, Teamsters Local 439, 131 BNA LA 619
   (Riker, 2012) 487
- Alliant Energy, 134 BNA LA 1217 (A. Wolff, 2015)
   The Problem of Subcontracting 500

#### E. Social Media 500

Robert L. Arrington, Aaron Duffy, Elizabeth Rita, When Worlds Collide: An Arbitrator's Guide To Social Networking Issues In Labor And Employment Cases 501

 The City of ADA and International Association of Firefighters, Local 2298, 134 BNA LA 702 (Lumbley, 2014)

Summary of Cases Involving Social Media 512

The Problem With Social Media and Off-Duty Conduct 515

#### F. Benefits 517

- 1. The Green Transit Authority, Unpublished Decision, (F. Weatherspoon, 2010) 517
- Stanley Black & Decker and the United Steelworkers AFL-CIO-CLC-Local No. 6463, 128 LA 1639
   (F. Weatherspoon, 2011) 523

The Problem With Modifying Employee Benefits 532

# G. Wages and Hours 533

- 1. 2004 AAA LEXIS 244, American Arbitration Association (F.Weatherspoon, 2004) 53
- 2. 2004 AAA Lexis 1490, American Arbitration Association, (Weatherspoon, 2004) 538
- Lithonia Hi Tek Vermilion And Local 998, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, 109
   BNA LA 775 (Franckiewicz, 1997) 542

The Problem With Work Hours 547

# H. Safety Policies 549

 Carrier Corporation, Mcminnville, Tennessee And Sheet Metal Workers International Association, Local 483 110 BNA LA 1064 (Ipavec, 1998)  Oncor Elec. Delivery Co., LLC and Electrical Workers IBEW 134 BNA LA 1264 (Moore, 2015) 554

The Problem of Safety of Employees and the Public 560

# I. Schedules and Telework 561

Keystone Steel & Wire and Independent Steel Alliance, 132 954 (Mark W. Suardi, 2013)
 The Problem of Shift Changes
 567

#### J. Off Duty Conduct 568

- 1. City of Seldovia, 133 BNA LA 1593 (Landau, 2014) 569
- 2. City of Philadelphia, 127 BNA LA 1384 (K. Lang, 2010) 575

Summary of Cases on Off-Duty Conduct 581

The Problem of Off-Duty Conduct 584

#### K. Interest Arbitration 585

- University of Cincinnati and International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 20, 133 LA 1658
   (F. Weatherspoon, 2014) 585
- Virgin Islands Government Hospitals And Health Facilities Corporation, V.I. Hospitals and Association Of Hospital Employed Physicians (Ahep)
   593
- Fraternal Order of Police Queen City Lodge, No. 69 and City of Cincinnati, Ohio State Employment Relations Board, 08-Med. 07-0743 (2009) 602

#### VII. ARBITRATION OF EMPLOYMENT DISPUTES IN LABOR ARBITRATION 611

# A. Supreme Court Decisions 611

- 1. Alexander v. Gardner-Denver Co., 415 U.S. 36 (1974) 611
- 2. Wright v. Universal Mar. Serv. Corp., 525 U. S. 70 (1998) 617
- 3. 14 Penn Plaza LLC v. Pyett, 556 U.S. 247 (2009) 622

# B. Lower Court Application of Penn Plaza 631

- 1. Shipkevich V. Staten Island University Hosp. 2009 WL 1706590 (E.D.N.Y.2009) 63:
- 2. Volpei v. County of Ventura, 221 Cal. App. 4th 391, 163 Cal. Rptr. 3d 926 (2013) 634

Floyd D. Weatherspoon, Incorporating Mandatory Arbitration Employment Clauses Into

Collective Bargaining Agreements: Challenges And Benefits To The Employer And The Union,

38 Del. J. Corp. L. (2014) 639

# VIII. REMEDIES IN LABOR ARBITRATION 647

# A. Reinstatement with No Back Pay 647

1. The University of Green, Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2014) 648

# B. Rightful Position 655

 Fraternal Order of Police, Ohio Labor Council v. Wright State, 2011 LA Supp. 119780 (F. Weatherspoon, 2011) 655

#### IX. DEVELOPMENT OF EMPLOYMENT ARBITRATION 661

# A. Compulsory Arbitration 661

- 1. Gilmer v. Interstate/Johnson Lane, Corp., 500 U.S. 20, 111 S.Ct. 1647 (1991) 663
- 2. Circuit City Stores, Inc. v. Adams, 532 U.S. 105, 121 S.Ct. 1302 (2001) 668
- 3. E.E.O.C. v. Waffle House, Inc., 534 U.S. 279, 122 S.Ct. 754 (2002) 675
- 4. Chavarria v. Ralphs Grocery Company, 733 F.3d 916 (2013) 682

# B. Discrimination Claims 688

- 1. 2010 AAA Employment LEXIS 105, (F. Weatherspoon, 2010 688
- 2. Green Mortgage Bank, Unpublished Decision (Floyd D. Weatherspoon, 2007) 696

# C. Contract Disputes 703

- 1. 2004 LEXIS 141 (F. Weatherspoon, 2004) 703
- 2. Green State University, (F. Weatherspoon, 2007) 711
- 3. Green City Bank, Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2007) 717

# D. Employment Statutes 721

- 1. The Green Building Company, Inc., Unpublished Decision (F. Weatherspoon, 2007) 72:
- 2. 2011 AAA Employment LEXIS 232, 9A. McKissick, 2011) 726
- 3. 2015 AAA Employment Lexis 119 (F. Weatherspoon, 2015) 733

#### RESOURCES 739

INDEX 741